

A Comparison of 6 Introductory Organizational Behaviour Texts

by Martin Corbett, Warwick Business School, UK

Quick Summary

	Bratton, Callinan, Forshaw & Sawchuk	Huczynski & Buchanan	Robbins & Judge	Knights & Willmott	Fincham & Rhodes	Buelens, Van Den Broeck, Vanderheyden, Kreitner & Kinicki
	Work and Organizational Behaviour	Organizational Behaviour	Organizational Behaviour	Introducing Organizational Behaviour & Management	Organizational Behaviour	Organisational Behaviour
	1 st edition Palgrave Macmillan	6 th edition FT Prentice Hall	12 th edition Prentice Hall	1 st edition Thomson Learning	4 th edition Oxford University Press	European edition McGraw Hill Higher Education
	£34.99	£39.99	£45.99	£39.99	£31.99	£40.99
USE THIS BOOK IF...	You want a text with sensitive coverage of Northern America and Europe.	You want a text that covers every conceivable OB topic in depth	You want a text with a very strong US bias and access to an impressive range of on-line resources	You want a text with a heavy bias towards sociological / organisation theory	You want a text with a bias towards sociology and the UK	You want a comprehensive text with a European flavour and a very strong emphasis on the psychological dimensions of OB
BUT.....	Excellent references to website sources	A good balance of the psychological and the sociological	However, the text is largely uncritical and has a very strong bias towards psychological aspects of OB	It has a critical slant to it which is juxtaposed with the more orthodox OB syllabus	It covers issues in less depth than it's glossier competitors but is an easier read	It is a rather unattractive book for the price and its writing style is not as engaging as the other texts examined here
	A good balance of the psychological and the sociological.	Has a UK bias which may not suit courses with a high proportion of overseas students		The links between the chapters and topics are weak	It's UK bias may not suit courses with a high proportion of overseas students	Good on-line resources but with a heavy managerial bias
	Suitable for any large basic level Undergraduate OB course.	Some students may find the volume and depth of information overwhelming		Despite the chapter on globalisation, this book has a heavy UK bias which may not suit courses with a high proportion of overseas students	On-line resources are underwhelming	
	Has the advantage of smaller size and so avoids over-burdening the student with excessive detail without sacrificing breadth of coverage					

Contents and 'shape'

	<i>Bratton et al</i>	<i>Huczynski et al</i>	<i>Robbins et al</i>	<i>Knights et al</i>	<i>Fincham et al</i>	<i>Buelens et al</i>
Chapter / topics	History of Work Management Leadership Personality Perception Learning Motivation Diversity Groups Communication Decision-making Power Structure Technology HRM	Environment Technology Learning Personality Communication Perception Motivation Groups (x3) Job design Structure (x2) Strategy Org'n Development Org'n change Org'n culture HRM Leadership Decision-making Conflict Power	Learning Attitudes Personality Perception Motivation (x2) Emotion Groups (x2) Communication Leadership (x2) Power Conflict Structure Culture HRM Change	Motivation Personality Groups Learning & Knowledge Structure Leadership Decision-making Org'n culture Change Technology Globalization Post-bureaucracy Ethics	Learning Stress Personality Motivation Groups (x2) Leadership Labour process Conflict Job design Structure (x2) Orgn change Orgn culture Power Knowledge management Markets & occupations Gender Technology	Personality Attitudes Perception Motivation (x2) Stress Communication Groups (x2) Leadership Decision-making Power & conflict Structure National culture Learning & change Ethics
Differentiating topics/chapters	Diversity	Strategy	Emotion	Globalisation	Gender	National cultural differences
No. of Pages	543	935	759	551	784	724
Percentage micro (psychological)	44	40	56	27	36	60
Percentage macro (sociological)	30	41	24	62	51	30
Percentage other (references, exercises, cases, , etc).	26	19	20	11	13	10
Ratio micro to macro	60 : 40	50 : 50	70 : 30	30 : 70	40 : 60	2 : 1

Accessibility

	<i>Bratton et al</i>	<i>Huczynski et al</i>	<i>Robbins et al</i>	<i>Knights et al</i>	<i>Fincham et al</i>	<i>Buelens et al</i>
Conceptual difficulty	Low	Low	Low	High	Low	Medium
Clarity of Language	Good	Good	Poor	Good	Good	Variable (different authors write each chapter)
Parochialism of language/examples	Good mix of examples from North America and Northern Europe	Case examples biased towards US and UK. Cartoons very American	Significant US bias although the book contains numerous examples of Chinese business practices. Virtually nothing European	Remarkably so. Except for the chapter on globalisation, case examples are all UK and US with a bias towards football, manufacturing and bars	Biased toward the UK and, to a lesser extent, the US	Significant Western European bias
Accessibility of language	Excellent	Good but there is too much information crammed into each chapter	Excellent	Varied (depending on chapter authors)	Good although limited use of examples and a bias toward industrial sociology	Okay although the authors cram rather too much information into each chapter. The overall tone is distinctly managerial and uncritical
Engagingness for students	<p>Attractive page design.</p> <p>Good use of colour</p> <p>Good use of text book shading to highlight words in glossary</p> <p>Overall, the best looking book of the six</p> <p>Aimed at a broad audience</p>	<p>Good use of colour but the layout is cluttered and contains far too many B&W pictures of (male) theorists.</p> <p>Cartoons are trivial and US biased</p> <p>The frequent 'stop and think' boxes don't work</p> <p>Aimed at the UK market</p>	<p>Not as attractive as the texts to the left of the table. Colour photos seem to be included for aesthetic reasons only</p> <p>The Point-Counterpoint sections at the end of each chapter are good</p> <p>Aimed at the US market</p>	<p>The least attractive of the four glossy titles</p> <p>Good use of colour to highlight words in glossary</p> <p>The Thinkpoints are distracting and too frequent</p> <p>The choice of photographs appears arbitrary</p>	<p>Basic use of colour</p> <p>Light on examples and cases</p>	<p>Basic colour scheme but has a washed-out look about it (too much grey)</p> <p>Excessive end notes</p> <p>Numerous examples help illustrate points, but probably crams too much information into each chapter</p> <p>The least engaging writing style of the five titles</p> <p>Aimed at the European market</p>

Criticality

<i>Bratton et al</i>	<i>Huczynski et al</i>	<i>Robbins et al</i>	<i>Knights et al</i>	<i>Fincham et al</i>	<i>Buelens et al</i>
Well balanced. Different viewpoints incorporated into the text	Well balanced although the 'You are the Manager' exercises at the end of each chapter tilt the book towards the managerial	Absolutely not	Attempts to sustain an 'orthodox' versus 'critical' stance but this is uneven across chapters Different viewpoints sharply differentiated with little attempt to resolve differences	Largely uncritical and stays with a broadly historical (UK) overview of the topics	Overly managerial

Practicality

<i>Bratton et al</i>	<i>Huczynski et al</i>	<i>Robbins et al</i>	<i>Knights et al</i>	<i>Fincham et al</i>	<i>Buelens et al</i>
Case studies at the end of each chapter encourage reader to apply theories and cement understanding. Excellent use of hyperlinks within each chapter and to the WWW generally.	Internet links largely restricted to end-of-chapter prompts to access the on-line learning resources	Mini cases at the end of each chapter. Poor internet links within the text but excellent on-line provision of tests, cases, exercises, videos and the like	Numerous illustrative cases within the chapters, but far too many exercises, thinkpoints, and boxes generally Internet links limited and restricted to the end of each chapter	Very limited number of illustrative cases or vignettes, but the easiest read of the all the texts Poor internet links	Limited cases. This book relies more on vignettes, but there are too many of them Good exercises at the end of each chapter Internet links poor

Value for Money

	<i>Bratton et al</i>	<i>Huczynski et al</i>	<i>Robbins et al</i>	<i>Knights et al</i>	<i>Fincham et al</i>	<i>Buelens et al</i>
Price	£34 .99	£39.99	£45.99	£39.99	£31.99	£40.99
Price vs fit to course	Excellent	Okay but does any course cover the material in such detail?	At this undiscounted price this is a lot to pay for a book with weak coverage of the macro level	A lot to pay for a text with poor coverage of the micro level. May not suit students with a natural science background	Competitively priced offering good overall coverage. It's strong UK and sociology bias may not suit all lectures or students	Okay but does any course cover the micro level material in such detail?
Price vs design	Excellent. This is a nice contemporary and uncluttered design. The best of the bunch against this criterion	Okay, although the layout is dense and is beginning to look dated	Over-priced But excellent on-line resources CD included with the book	The uses of colour and the choice of photographs could be improved. Given this, the price is too high for the poor value-added these provide	The cheapest book in the pack but it looks it Very little improvement on the previous edition Basic on-line resources	Over-priced. Poor use of colour The worst against this criterion